2006 JICA Visiting Fellow Research Report

Vocational and Industrial Human Resource Development through TVET in Africa:

Changing Assistance Environments and Human Resource Demands

August 2007

Institute for International Cooperation
Japan International Cooperation Agency

National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies

IIC
JR
07-04

Vocational and Industrial Human Resource Development through TVET in Africa: Changing Assistance Environments and Human Resource Demands August 2007 IFIC/JICA GRIPS

ISBN4-903645-36-3

2006 JICA Visiting Fellow Research Report

Vocational and Industrial Human Resource Development through TVET in Africa:

Changing Assistance Environments and Human Resource Demands

Shoko Yamada
(National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies)

Noriko Matsuda
(International Cooperation Bureau, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan)

August 2007

Institute for International Cooperation
Japan International Cooperation Agency

National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies

Published by: Research Group, Institute for International Cooperation (IFIC), Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)
10-5 Ichigaya Honmura-cho, Shinjyuku-ku, Tokyo 162-8433, Japan
FAX: +81-3-3269-2185 E-mail: iictae@jica.go.jp

National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies (GRIPS)
7-22-1 Roppongi, Minatoku, Tokyo 106-8677, Japan
Phone: +81-3-6439-6337
URL: http://www.grips.ac.jp/

Contents

List of Figures, Tables and Boxes

Abbreviations

AU	African Union
CBT	Competency-Based Training
COTVET	Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DED	Deutscher Entwicklungsdienst gGmbH
EFA	Education for All
ESP	Education Strategic Plan
ESSP	Education Sector Strategic Plan
EU	European Union
FCUBE	Free Compulsory Universal Basic Education
FTI	Fast Track Initiative
GPRS I	Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy 2003-2005
GPRS II	Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy 2006-2009
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
ILO	International Labour Organization
JBIC	Japan Bank for International Cooperation
KfW	Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau
LLDC	Least among Less Developed Countries
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NACVET	National Coordinating Committee for TVET
NAI	New African Initiative
NEPAD	The New Partnership for Africa's Development
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OJT	On the Job Training
PCO	Project Coordination Office
PEAP	Poverty Eradication Action Plan
PEVOT	Programme of Employment Oriented Vocational Training and Education
PIF	Policy Investment Framework
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategic Paper
SADC	Southern African Development Community

SME	Small and Micro-Enterprises
SWAp	Sector Wide Approach
TEVET	Technical, Entrepreneurial and Vocational Education and Training
TICAD	Tokyo International Conference on African Development
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Fund
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UPC	Universal Primary Completion
UPE	Universal Primary Education
UVQF	Uganda Vocational Qualification Framework
WFP	United Nations World Food Programme

Abstract Summary

Background and Objectives for This Research

To date, Japan has cast its initiatives in Africa targeting public pre-service education and training as belonging under Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) assistance, thereby accumulating a long record of results. Also, as can be seen in the examples of Uganda and Malawi, recent trends show that in Africa control over the administration of TVET in its capacity as pre-service education and training is being shifted from Ministries of Labor or Vocational Training to that of Education, while, in line with progressive aid harmonization, TVET has also come to be cast squarely within education sector plans as well. Moreover, in the education sector, expansion of basic education (and in particular, primary education) was raised as a priority concern at the 1990 World Conference on Education for All in Jomtien, and while the inclination of developing country governments towards TVET and higher education had not gone away, it did indeed become dormant. However, in recent years, a desire has surfaced to actively recognize anew the role of the TVET sector from the perspective of promoting poverty reduction and human security, as given in the Millennium Development Goals, as well as with an eye to achieve national development through technical innovations spurred by the advance of globalization. At the Gleneagles G8 Summit in 2005, often called 'Africa's year' the G8 nations agreed to see that aid to Africa will be doubled by 2010 and the international community's concern over aid to Africa has grown with every subsequent year.

In response to these changes in the aid environment, the authors herein, after giving a general outline of present conditions and issues concerning human resource development suited to labor demand in Africa, shall present research on TVET viewed from the education sector based on field surveys conducted in Ghana and Uganda, where JICA provides TVET assistance, as well as in Malawi, where the government demand for assistance in this area is growing. In addition, based on this analysis of the present situation, the authors aim to provide concrete recommendations concerning the Japanese TVET assistance in Africa. According to JICA's thematic guidelines on TVET, the less-developed African countries focused on in this survey categorically qualify for skills development assistance – that is, assistance in vocational skills training primarily geared towards improving the livelihoods of the poor and socially vulnerable so as to directly contribute to poverty reduction by facilitating their ability to acquire basic skills and incomes. There is no question as to the importance of skills development for reducing poverty, but the authors, while deferring from becoming too involved in particular classifications from JICA's thematic guidelines, would like to discuss Japan's TVET assistance to Africa from the view of positive performance in industrial human resource development derived through public pre-service education and training assistance, as well as the need to comprehensively

manage assistance in skills development for the poorest segments of the population by including national economic policy, analyses of labor demand, and policy supporting entrepreneurs, so that a path to real improvements in livelihoods can be shaped.

Section 1: Relevancy of and Support Environment for TVET Assistance in Africa

This section gives a general outline of recent developments in Africa to show how the formation of the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD) and the African Union (AU) by African nations has demonstrated their ownership over African issues and efforts to resolve them, while at the same time examples of growing concern for Africa from within the international community, such as the World Bank's naming of the ten-year period between 2005 and 2015 to be 'the Decade of Africa', will be included.

In addition, in order to give context to educational development this section will look back on past changes in support trends, namely the fact that despite the concentration of aid in the TVET sector along with higher education in the 1960s and 1970s, in the 1990s the emphasis of aid was redirected away from growth-oriented approaches towards support for rectifying regional disparities and reducing poverty, thus resulting in a subsequent shift in the emphasis of educational assistance as well towards primary education. Also, the authors illustrate how poverty rates in Africa's less-developed countries have, to the contrary, been on the rise since calls for poverty reduction began in the 2000s, and – in response to unemployment rates growing disproportionately among youth who have completed basic education in comparison to the general population – the World Bank, International Labour Organization (ILO), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), and other organizations have recently shown drive towards actively recognizing anew the role of TVET.

A large portion of Japan's educational support had for many years gone to TVET, but it has recently been in decline as increases in basic education assistance have taken place and Japan has concentrated regionally in Asia, thereby limiting programs targeting Africa. However, new undertakings in Africa are gaining attention such as intraregional cooperation (South-South cooperation), support in the form of policy proposals, and assistance for reintegrating demobilized soldiers into society.

Section 2: Present Conditions and Issues Concerning TVET Supply and Demand in Africa

This section gives an outline of general conditions in Africa's manufacturing industries and labor markets based on statistical data showing, among other things, that with the exception of South Africa most countries do not even have 10% of their workforce in manufacturing, that macroeconomic indicators in many countries declined from the 1980s, when structural adjustment policies were introduced, up to the 1990s, and that the proportion of Small and Micro-Enterprises (SME) within Africa's industrial structure is extremely high. Also, a sizable number of entrepreneurships and micro-businesses are located in the informal sector; however, the gap between those at the upper and lower strata of the informal sector is extremely wide, meaning that while growth-oriented programs are

applicable to those at the top, the principal task for those at the bottom is to improve earnings so as to reduce poverty.

Next, after reviewing major themes in previous works on industrial human resource development, from economic as well as political and social perspectives, this section continues by showing a variety of skills formation methods arranged according to the levels of skills and modes of education and training. Also, though basic education is extremely important as a foundation for skills acquisition, since that alone will not result in competitive competency skills for the market, the high social relevance of trainings for the informal sector, the provision of equal opportunity to the poorest segments of the population through voucher systems, and apprenticeship systems are all discussed in contrast to the primary target of past TVET assistance – secondary education. Furthermore, skills levels necessary at each stage of industrial development are visually presented as a reference for gauging policy.

In this discussion, the authors provide that the government's primary role in TVET is in designing systems and drafting law while simultaneously collaborating with industry and the private training sector, whereas it ought to keep direct implementation of trainings to a minimum. Upon establishing this, the authors go on to summarize the roles that government ought to play in TVET, the means to fulfilling those roles, and the strengths and weaknesses of the said means. Problems in industrial human resources policy are also addressed by looking at the fact that, at the present time, numerous African countries fail to accurately grasp labor demand as currently estimated based on data from the formal sector – which comprises only 10-30% of the workforce; as a result, industrial human resources policy ultimately attaches too much importance on the formal sector, and also less effective from a poverty reduction perspective.

Section 3: TVET as Viewed from the Education Sector

In section 3, the authors will first organize 6 vantage points, i.e. 1) the expansion of primary education and handling its graduates, 2) secondary education as vocational preparation for graduates that complete schooling at the secondary level without proceeding to the tertiary level, 3) recognizing anew the role of tertiary education in the cultivation of technical experts, 4) mastering artisan level skills through non-formal education, 5) the introduction of Competency-Based Training (CBT) and 6) aid harmonization, each covering top policy concerns relating to recent educational developments in Africa and the growing trend of putting administrative responsibility for TVET pre-service education and training under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Education instead of other ministries. Based upon these points, the authors will analyze the relationship between TVET and national policy using case studies from Ghana, Uganda, and Malawi.

Moreover, limitations on TVET as covered by education sector plans will be provided as points to consider concerning the future of TVET assistance. This section also touches on difficulties faced when approaching, through the public education system, the problem of large numbers of school-age youth unable to go to school or find employment in Africa, though support for this strata is crucial for

the promotion of human security. Moreover, as aid harmonization extends through the education sector, the need to coordinate initiatives with the policy of respective host countries is currently being emphasized which may appear restrictive for parties that are used to running projects independently of government and other donor initiatives; however, as can be seen in the target countries for the case study herein, the education sector plans are, to the contrary, seen as having the potential for being flexibly modified as work progresses, thus demonstrating the importance of stimulating the government, local donors, and other related parties to form policy together through sustained dialogue.

Section 4: Issues in and Recommendations for TVET Assistance in Africa

In Africa, the formation of supporting industries capable of attracting foreign capital by cultivating the skills of workers at the SME is essential for providing people with the means to a stable livelihood and extending national economic growth; meanwhile, the authors emphasize that the degree to which organic collaboration can be formed between a variety of actors (i.e. private sector and non-education ministries) is one key point for supporting the course of such formation. In addition to the above points, Section 4 shows how Japan may, even within aid harmonization, effectively implement technical cooperation projects utilizing its own experiences as long as it is able to involve other partners in sustained policy consultations, as seen in examples set by Ghana and Uganda. Further mention is also made of expectations for what is to come in the design and implementation of the All-Japan initiatives including harmonization between schemes made possible under the 2008 JICA reform, and the utilization of trust funds established by Japan at United Nations (UN) agencies.

Also, the authors have put in order several points in discussion concerning what JICA ought to consider should it proceed with future TVET assistance in Africa. First, this section recommends that support for cultivating trades workers ought to both shift its aim away from employment in the formal sector more towards shaping domestic supporting industries, and be re-visualized in programs that comprehensively cross the social services sector, the economic infrastructure sector, and the direct manufacturing sector. Then, skills development support for the forgotten majority, one challenge for the future, is revealed as sharing a common foundation with the people-centered concept of ensuring human security. The authors close by suggesting to JICA the possibility of technical assistance covering data analysis and strategizing so that assisted governments would cast human resource development strategy within a more comprehensive policy analysis, while executing model projects relating to artisan-level human resource development in Small and Micro-Enterprises. Assistance will be two-tiered, so to speak, both at the levels of policy-making and of actual field intervention. The authors also recommend support for South-South Cooperation wherein these African countries can learn strategies in human resource development from the experiences of their Asian predecessors.

Introduction

Just as in many other regions, one great policy concern in Africa is cultivating human resources suited to labor demand. However, in order to effectively tackle this problem, human resource development plans must be clearly cast within, and simultaneously linked to, the economic development vision of the government concerned. For example, plans made for developing human resources will differ depending on what industries a government is inclined to cultivate, and conversely where there are social groups experiencing high unemployment due to the inability of current labor markets to absorb them. Therefore, it may be necessary to reevaluate industrial policy for the sake of stimulating equitable development in society based on the concept of creating employment through vitalization of the aforementioned groups' productive activities. While, education has universal elements (e.g. human development and the transmission of universal knowledge) that are thus unaffected by specific social conditions, at the same time, as education is meant to nurture members of each particular society, it would be impossible for it to stand independently without any relation to the varieties of social activities, including productive activities, taking place in the social realm.

Nevertheless, a large number of governments in Sub-Sahara Africa have not effectively facilitated rearing of human resources suited to the labor market. One reason for this failure is found in ambitious, yet unrealistic, policy. A great number of the poor countries in Sub-Sahara Africa have a strong desire to place their investments in tertiary education as a means to catch up to advanced industrial nations, even though their chances for introducing private foreign capital and developing high tech industries is not very high at all. Meanwhile, despite the fact that a majority of Africa's economy is composed of the informal sector, labor market surveys conducted sporadically only look at the formal sector, which means that governments have been unable to grasp a sizable portion of domestic economic activity and thereby fail to propose effective policy. Furthermore, too often, the education and industry sectors exist separately from each other and while the importance of the school-to-work transition of students is being advocated, discussion of these matters has failed to probe deeper than the surface, resulting in a lack of realistic policy linking school education to the labor market. Also, another reason for the low rate of people reaching employment through technical and vocational education is based in the unseasoned trust and collaboration found between governments and employers (from major enterprises to individual shops), all while socially-constructed and commonly-held beliefs dictate that technical and vocational education are lower in value than academic courses. In this way, direct operation of technical and vocational schools by the government are commonly criticized in view of both economic efficacy and public interest. However, the government's role in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) sector is not limited to the management of vocational training schools – to the contrary, in order that human resource development effectively contributes to industrial development, only the government has the capacity to carry out the establishment of laws and systems, assistance to private human resource development institutions and, moreover, the implementation of aid for development to the poor and socially vulnerable classes to whom market mechanisms have failed to

deliver training. In reality, the high unemployment rate among youth who have completed basic education has become a sizable social problem in African countries, and, at the present time, a reevaluation of education policy with reference to labor and industrial policy must be undertaken without delay.

Despite the great need for human resource development suited to labor demand in Africa, TVET is still given fairly low priority within policy discussions on the education sector and discussions relating to international development cooperation among aid agencies. In the 1960s, when a number of former colonies claimed their independence, there was a temporary expansion of aid into both tertiary and technical and vocational education out of the demand set by rapid nation-building; however, since the 1970s, aid to this category of education has gone into decline[1]. In particular, upon entering the 1990s, a large paradigm shift took place in the field of international development cooperation wherein the orientation of aid was transitioned from growth to poverty reduction. Basic education was cast as a vital social service for poverty reduction, alongside primary health care, and priority in policy and budgeting came to be directed towards basic education (i.e. primary and lower secondary education). By way of this paradigm shift in international aid, while the inclination of developing country governments towards TVET and higher education had not gone away, it did indeed become dormant; meanwhile assistance given by aid agencies to the education sector was re-concentrated in basic education. Furthermore, a new means of giving aid honoring the autonomy (i.e. ownership) of aid recipient governments also took place along with the paradigm shift towards poverty reduction. In the past aid agencies would provide aid in the form of projects carried out independently of other parties from planning to implementation, and owing to the fact that such operations often did not reflect the entirety of a given nation's development – since they were conducted neither in line with the financial and administrative systems of the governments concerned, nor under sufficient collaboration among aid agencies – aid was criticized for bringing about overlapping projects and overabundant support in certain favored fields. Based on this critical insight, from the latter half of the 1990s, the aid community came to endorse giving financial support to policy proposed independently by the government concerned and thereafter approved by them. This new method was introduced into the education sector at a particularly early time, compared to other sectors, and the switch over to harmonization and collaboration among aid agencies, as well as support in the form of financing, has been pushed forward by way of the structure provided by sector programs based on sector development strategy. With few exceptions, the education sector development strategies, and hense, the sector programs of various developing countries, prioritized primary education. Depending on the country, approaches to and the degree to which sector programs and financial support are utilized will vary, but generally speaking, the rapid speed by which this shift is taking place is most notable in Sub-Sahara

1 For example, assistance given by the World Bank to TVET (including those provided at different forms and levels of education, such as secondary, post-secondary, non-formal, and teacher training) comprised 51% of all investments into education over the period of 1963-1976, 44% for 1977-86, and 25% by 1990. Jones (1992) p.182.

African countries, where reliance on aid is high and the World Bank and other aid agencies promoting these new methods have great influence.

Within the structure set by this sector program framework and its emphasis on basic education, any aid in the form of a project applied in sectors outside of basic education would require careful handling. Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) has established a long history of results in TVET assistance, while Japan itself succeeded in industrial human resource development through education to support its own high levels of economic growth[2] and has also gained experience in supporting the economic development of Asian middle-income countries, thus lending credence to the idea of 'cultivating human resources through education so as to contribute to industrial development' has deep roots in Japan. Meanwhile, there is no doubt that African governments are clamoring for industrial human resource development, even if current planning and implementation may lack realism, or there is a shortage of information upon which policy analysis can be based. While the need for TVET is evident, the key to executing future TVET assistance in Africa is in whether TVET assistance can be presented in current support settings in both convincing and truly effective ways. In actuality, upon examination of excessive support put towards basic education in the past, the World Bank has itself released a report stating that TVET ought to be expanded while a balance with Universal Primary Education (UPE) be maintained[3]. It is often said that while basic education is necessary as a foundation for acquiring vocational skills, one cannot gain technical skills from basic education alone[4]. In consideration of the fact that poverty reduction cannot be achieved where employment is not gained, technical and vocational education is just as necessary for poverty reduction as basic education[5]. In other words, TVET assistance possesses sufficient relevance within the current poverty reduction paradigm. However, the argument that anything as long as it fits within TVET can potentially contribute to poverty reduction would be unfounded since the field of TVET itself is inclusive of programs ranging from human resource development for the informal sector and small and medium sized enterprises, to schooling at tertiary education institutions for engineering and high technologies skills. Also, there is no denying that the TVET sub-sector as a whole has been criticized for varying problems in its economic efficacy or relevance, while it is also quite complicated owing to the variety of agencies and private sector actors involved. Furthermore, in the current support environment it is becoming increasingly necessary for aid agencies to incorporate higher levels of policy discussions and the involvement of other agencies', due to how difficult it would be to give a logical explanation for independently carrying out projects, as had once been done in decades before.

In this report, while giving a general summary of the current conditions and issues surrounding industrial human resource development in Africa, the authors will make observations based on their field surveys of countries where JICA is already involved in TVET initiatives (Ghana and Uganda) as

---

2 Institute for Social Engineering (1995); JICA (2005a).
3 Johanson and Adams (2004) pp.11-12.
4 Broadman (2006) p.21.
5 Bennell (1999) p.1, 3.

well as a country where the government is increasingly calling for aid (Malawi) so as to answer questions concerning: what kinds of TVET assistance aid agencies, including Japan, are providing in modern-day Africa; what types of results and issues could be derived from such assistance; and what kinds of assistance could be implemented in the future. In this way, the authors hope to contribute to the debate taking place concerning TVET, a field of growing importance in Africa. Moreover, this survey is limited to the low-income countries of Sub-Sahara Africa and excludes South Africa, Botswana, and other middle-income countries and, based on the common labor conditions and economies that link these countries, it aims to analyze industrial human resource development from the view of making poverty reduction practicable. Consequently, the reader must be advised that the 'Africa' referred to in this report does not include North African (Maghreb) or middle-income countries.